



RANCHO SANTA FE FIRE PROTECTION DISTRICT REGULAR BOARD OF DIRECTORS MEETING MINUTES

Rancho Santa Fe Fire Protection District - Board/Community Room
16936 El Fuego
Rancho Santa Fe, California

August 22, 2003
9:00 a.m.

1. *Meeting Called to Order/Roll Call*

President Ashcraft called the meeting to order at 9:00 a.m.

Directors Present: Ashcraft, Douglas, Hickerson, Hillgren, Lombard

Directors Absent: None

Staff Present: Erwin Willis, Fire Chief; Nick Pavone, Deputy Chief; Don Butz, Deputy Chief,
Cliff Hunter, Fire Marshal; Karlana Rannals, Board Clerk

President Ashcraft welcomed Cliff Hunter, Fire Marshal to the District and the meeting.

2. *Pledge of Allegiance*

Director Ashcraft led the Pledge of Allegiance.

3. *Special Presentation*

President Ashcraft with the assistance of Chief Willis made a special presentation to the following administrative personnel:

Deputy Chief Don Butz – a plaque in recognition for his work as project manager on the construction of the new 4S Ranch Fire Station.

Deputy Chief Nick Pavone – an Award of Excellence in recognition of his tenure as Fire Marshal the past three years.

Karlana Rannals – an Award of Excellence in recognition for her dedication to the improvement of the District.

4. *Approval of Minutes*

MOTION BY DIRECTOR HILLGREN, SECOND BY DIRECTOR LOMBARD, and CARRIED 5 AYES; 0 NOES; 0 ABSENT; 0 ABSTAIN to approve as amended and file:

- a. Board of Directors regular meeting minutes held July 25, 2003.

5. *Security Patrol Monthly Report – July 2003*

Chief Wellhouser was unable to attend. Monthly report reviewed and filed.

6. *Correspondence*

Chief Willis read one letter of appreciation from Firefighter Paramedic Wos.

5. *Administrative Items*

a. *Fire Department Access Roads – Administrative Guidelines*

President Ashcraft informed the members of the public the format that would be followed on this item.

He would allow ample time for public comment (limited to 5 minutes per speaker) and that Staff would have the opportunity to speak first.

Fire Marshal Hunter presented a PowerPoint presentation that provided a background on the 24-foot roadway standard, which included fire codes, emergency access needs, and the proposed application to improve the substandard access roads.

President Ashcraft opened the item for public comment. The following is a summary of each speaker:

Gordon Barto, Las Colinas commented on the PowerPoint presentation and conveyed that residents moved to Rancho Santa Fe to enjoy the rural lifestyle. He encouraged the District to look at the requirement on a case-by-case basis and consider alternatives.

Marie Addario, Camino Privado spoke that the covenant is a complex area and that there should be varied ways to accommodate. Since the State has not increased their standard to 24-feet, and 20-feet seems to work, that that standard should be the minimum. She again informed them as President of the Art Jury, she reported that they did not want any roads to be widened in the covenant areas, and that there are many things for the Fire District to consider. She did inform them of the Art Jury's willingness to work towards a solution.

Douglas Gordon, La Gracia asked several questions pertaining to the presentation from the Fire Marshal and encouraged the Board of Directors to consider less than 20 feet in the overall plan and to keep things in perspective.

Daniel Claxton, Zumaque asked questions on the requirement of improving the frontage and the additional burden the District is applying to the homeowner.

Sara Levy-Buehner, 4390 Camino Privado acknowledged that she does not agree with what the Fire District is requiring. If the County only has 20 foot requirement that should be sufficient for the Fire District. Adding the additional 4 feet is an expense to the property owner that they should not bear.

Charles Christ, Puerta Del Sol spoke about the installation of a cell site and expressed his concern about fire safety. He also encouraged the Fire District to take into consideration the rural ambiance and how the streets would look. Also, look at the fact that it is economically unfair to the property owner.

Pete Smith, Rancho Santa Fe Association Manger, 17022 Avenida de Acacias commented on the District's obvious issue is the safety of all life and property. However, the requirement is a significant financial burden and an imposition on the neighbors. He believes that the benefit derived does not outweigh the cost. He encouraged the District to work on a comprehensive plan to deal with the issues surrounding the 24-foot requirement and consider the possibility of turnouts instead of 24-foot requirement.

Howard Crull, Camino Privado does not support the widening of his street, and suggested that the Fire District reduce the standard to the State Code – 20-feet.

Sugie Silver, Camino Privado supported that the street needs to be widened. She has experienced that with the cars parked on her street that it is difficult to drive past and asked her neighbors to ask their guests to pull off to the side of the road.

Jim Harrison, Artesian Road informed the Board that he lives on a private road with eight parcels. He is a retired firefighter and is understands the concern for life safety. He cannot afford to pave his road and knows that cooperation between neighbors is difficult and there are residents on his road living in their homes without a final permit. He encouraged the Board of Directors to listen to the residents with different situations.

Patty Queen, La Bajada expressed her concerns about the application of this requirement and the uniqueness of the community. Unique answers are necessary.

President Ashcraft reminded the public that the document presented is a Staff policy, not a Board policy. If the requirements were to change, a new Ordinance would be necessary. He requested that Staff have the opportunity to respond to the public questions and or their input.

Chief Willis responded to several questions and points presented during the public input period. He reported that Staff has tried to work with the residents since the current 24-foot standard was adopted in 1996, and that the guideline submitted for review and comment is to add flexibility without compromising life safety.

President Ashcraft offered each board member an opportunity to comment on the DRAFT guidelines.

Director Lombard – supported a compromise and that Staff consider reducing the standard to 20-feet. He noted that the resident assumes a greater risk in exchange for aesthetics and short term cost savings.

Director Hillgren – understood the dilemma between the life safety standards set by the fire district and the issue of aesthetics and cost. She supports a compromise by enforcing a 20-foot standard.

Director Ashcraft – supported a compromise by enforcing a 20-foot standard. He believes that it is either overregulation and/or unfair to ask one resident to bear the entire cost of widening the access roads to the nearest public street because they have chosen to remodel or build new construction.

Director Hickerson – does not support changing the standard and does not believe that safety should take a back seat to concerns about cost to a resident or ruin a town's rural atmosphere.

Director Douglas - supported maintaining the current 24 feet road width requirement for roads serving more than two residences, with District staff and Directors retaining discretionary authority to grant exceptions consistent with public safety in appropriate circumstances. His reasons for opposing a blanket narrowing of the road width requirement were:

When a fire occurs, it is imperative we respond as quickly as possible with as many resources as possible to stop the fire before it grows. Especially in wild land urban interface areas, such as large portions of our District, a fire will very quickly grow beyond the ability of all available resources to extinguish it. Fires in their early stages may double in size every five minutes without winds, and much faster with winds. The absence of adequate road access to a particular street, does not just endanger the residents and homes on that street, it endangers the entire community.

The houses being built in the District are now often very large, each the equivalent of several smaller homes, and requiring numerous resources to respond quickly when fire occurs at such a home. Many homes in our District, like the homes on Camino Privado, have only one road for emergency egress. Residents will be trapped if such a road becomes blocked during a fire.

The photographs presented of road widths with fire vehicles calmly parked during daylight hours do not accurately portray the reality of emergency conditions during fires, sometimes in darkness, when sirens blare, lights flash, frightened residents try quickly to evacuate horses, vehicles, possessions and themselves, and firefighters must drive, park and work safely in the

roadways. It is not in the best interest of our District, or any part of it, to make a blanket reduction in our required width for roads serving multiple residences.

President Ashcraft offered Staff after hearing the board members comments an opportunity to respond.

Chief Willis proposed to retain the District's ordinance at 24-feet in front of the resident's property, but allow the remainder of the road widened to 20 feet, the standard under state law. He reported that eventually, as other property owners built or remodeled, the narrower road way would reach 24 feet.

President Ashcraft requested a formal direction to Staff from the Board. Members directed Staff to return with new policy options based on the additional information provided by the Board.

MOTION BY DIRECTOR LOMBARD, SECOND BY DIRECTOR HILLGREN, and CARRIED 3 AYES; 2 NOES (DOUGLAS, HICKERSON); 0 ABSENT; 0 ABSTAIN to draft different policy options that looks at each private road individually and reflects the state standard of 20-feet.

b. Appeal – Request for Variance of Ordinance 03-01 Requirements

Fire Marshal Hunter summarized the Staff Report provided. Based upon the discussion and direction of the previous topic, the Board of Directors will need to accept the appeal of the property owner located at 4390 Camino Privado to reduce the roadway from the required 24 feet to the state standard of 20 feet.

The Board discussed with Staff the benefits of using a County standard of adding pullouts to the roadway standard.

MOTION BY DIRECTOR HILLGREN, SECOND BY DIRECTOR LOMBARD, and CARRIED 3 AYES; 2 NOES (DOUGLAS, HICKERSON); 0 ABSENT; 0 ABSTAIN to accept the request for variance from the property owner located at 4390 Camino Privado. This action by the Board of Directors authorizes the reduction of the District's Ordinance requirement for fire access roadway to 20-feet, and adds two 24-foot turnouts at locations approved by the Fire District.

Ten-minute recess

c. Selection & Award Request for Proposal – Construction of Training Facility & Tower

Chief Butz summarized Staff Report provided. He recommended that the Board of Directors award the proposals separate and award Project 1 to Erickson-Hall (\$ 445,000) and award Project 2 to Marcotte & Hearne (\$ 874,000). In doing the award separately, the District will receive a cost savings of 12% totaling \$190,000. Although this option will have a greater impact on staff time due to the coordination and construction management aspects than the other options, the savings are significant enough to merit this approach. Staff responded to questions from the Board.

MOTION BY DIRECTOR DOUGLAS, SECOND BY DIRECTOR HICKERSON, and CARRIED 5 AYES; 0 NOES; 0 ABSENT; 0 ABSTAIN to accept Staff's recommendation to select separate contractors for the construction of a Training Tower located at 16930 Four Gee road and authorize the President to execute the contract.

d. Selection of Architect and Award of Contract

Chief Willis summarized the process to select an architect and the negotiation meeting held with the

vendor of choice and the ad hoc committee to negotiate fees for services that include architectural, civil, mechanical, electrical and structural services. The committee recommended that the Board of Directors approve the selection of Don Iler, Architect with RRM Design Group for a fee of \$49,000.

MOTION BY DIRECTOR DOUGLAS, SECOND BY DIRECTOR HILLGREN, and CARRIED 5 AYES; 0 NOES; 0 ABSENT; 0 ABSTAIN to accept the ad hoc committee's recommendation for architectural services for the addition to the existing Administrative Building at 16936 El Fuego and authorize the President to execute the contract.

e. Board Workshop

Chief Willis informed the board members that Staff had met with Jim Boylan, Consultant, Pathfinders, to review the draft outline provided for the development of a strategic plan. Mr. Boylan has requested that the next step is to review the outline with the Board of Directors and requested that the members select a meeting date and time. The board members agreed to commit the time at the next regular meeting to discuss the outline with Mr. Boylan in lieu of a separate meeting date. They also agreed to the topic is a time certain matter on the agenda.

e. Appoint a Negotiating Committee

Chief Willis reported that the Firefighters Association has requested to meet, confer, and discuss compensation for employees that have accepted administrative assignments.

MOTION BY DIRECTOR DOUGLAS, SECOND BY DIRECTOR HICKERSON, CARRIED 5-0 to appoint Directors Ashcraft and Lombard to represent the District in these discussions

f. Board of Directors Meeting Dates & Times

The Board of Directors discussed the current meeting dates and times and noted that if a change were to occur, a new resolution would need to be adopted notifying the public of the change. The members discussed the advantages and disadvantages of changing the meeting time. At the conclusion of the discussion, there was no action taken.

8. Public Comment

No one requested to speak to the Board.

9. Staff Report

a. Fire Prevention Report

Fire Marshal Hunter reviewed the previous month's statistics, noting that new construction square footage has decreased. He has informed the Board that the activity of the Fire Marshal, which includes predevelopment has not been included in the report. He plans to modify the report to include all activities of the Fire Prevention Staff. Monthly report reviewed and filed.

b. Contaminated Soil

Chief Pavone distributed a copy of the report from Ninyo and Moore that includes options for the Board to consider for cleaning the contaminated soil. The Board will review the report and discuss this at a future meeting.

c. Operations Report

Chief Neville was unable to attend the meeting. Report deferred.

d. Training Report

Chief Butz summarized the previous month's training hours, which had an emphasis on the completion of the emergency vehicle operations course, and continuing education classes for Paramedics.

e. Fire Station(s) – Update:

Chief Butz reported on the following:

Rancho Cielo – they are waiting for the issuance of a grading permit.

Fairbanks Ranch – Chief Willis reported that the engineering firm, which is assisting the church with a site plan, moved the fire station to a new location. After contacting them, they agreed to move it back to the original location.

Admin Building – no additional information.

f. Negotiation for Exchange of Property Tax – Onyx Ridge Annexation

Chief Willis informed the board members that the owner of the 22-acre project (Onyx Ridge) has requested to deannex from the area served by the Elfin Forest Volunteer Fire Department, and annex to Rancho Santa Fe Fire Protection District. The County has a minimum 2% property tax exchange rate. He was able to negotiate an exchange rate just below 4%. There was no objection from the Board of Directors to serve the proposed annexation for the rate negotiated.

g. Response Time Evaluation for Fairbanks and Rancho Stations

Chief Willis distributed map demonstrating response times for the Fairbanks Ranch and Rancho Fire Stations. He also included how the response times would look if the Fairbanks Ranch Fire Station were relocated to a new site. He requested direction from the Board on whether or not to proceed. At the conclusion of the discussion, the Board directed Staff to continue researching costs to install a bridge at El Apajo and San Dieguito river.

10. Finance

a. List of Demands – July 2003

Monthly report reviewed and filed.

b. Budget Authorizations

Chief Willis discussed each request and the board took the following action

Description	FY 03/04 Budget	Funding Request	Funding Source	Action Requested
<i>Special Event Funding – Pancake Breakfast – October 12, 2003</i>	\$0.00	\$500.00	<i>Reserves</i>	Approve the request to support the annual Firefighters Association Pancake Breakfast.

The annual pancake breakfast provides the District the opportunity to provide fire prevention education to a large segment of our community by inviting them into the headquarters fire station. The expenditure allows the District to co-sponsor this event with the Firefighters Association

Directors Hickers and Douglas stated their approval was for this year only and not as an annual contribution.

MOTION BY DIRECTOR LOMBARD, SECOND BY DIRECTOR HILLGREN, CARRIED 5-0.

<i>Color Printer</i>	\$6,500	\$6,000	<i>Equipment Replacement Reserves</i>	Approve the request to proceed and purchase requested printer.
----------------------	---------	---------	---------------------------------------	--

This printer will replace a six-year old color printer in fire prevention. The existing printer, which is extremely slow, has reached its service life and we have had numerous problems with it.

MOTION BY DIRECTOR HILLGREN, SECOND BY DIRECTOR LOMBARD, CARRIED 5-0.

<i>District Mapping Response Time</i>	\$0.00	\$6,000	<i>Reserves</i>	Approve the request and authorize the Fire Chief to execute contract for professional services.
---------------------------------------	--------	---------	-----------------	---

Staff and the Board are working to evaluate and improve response time. Staff reported that currently, there is no way of evaluating our response times and whether they are the best that can be achieved given road conditions. These GIS maps will provide a tool to improve response times by providing information what response time should be achievable by each engine company.

MOTION BY DIRECTOR HICKERSON, SECOND BY DIRECTOR LOMBARD, CARRIED 5-0.

<i>Video Teleconferencing System</i>	\$30,000	\$100,000	<i>General Reserves</i>	Approve the request and authorize Staff proceed with the purchase and implementation.
--------------------------------------	----------	-----------	-------------------------	---

All north San Diego County Fire Departments agreed to participate in a FEMA grant application to create a zone wide video teleconferencing system. The preliminary reports indicate that the grant will be awarded. The next phase requires that each agency commit their share of funding (30%). This zone-wide system will allow training to occur and leave engines in their first in area.

MOTION BY DIRECTOR DOUGLAS, SECOND BY DIRECTOR HICKERSON, CARRIED 5-0.

10. *Directors Report*

a. *North County Dispatch JPA – Director Ashcraft reported the following:*

No report

b. *CSA-17 – Director Lombard reported on the following:*

Meeting held August 5, 2003 and they approved the FY 03/04. They were also informed, that a surplus from the prior fiscal year was anticipated.

August 22, 2003

c. Ad Hoc Committee – SFID Projects

No report.

11. Directors Comments

Director Douglas reported that the item listed on the agenda was incorrect. He wanted to discuss whether the District should respond to the “letter to the editor” in the Review. He requested this item be listed for the next meeting. He also requested that the agenda include the matter that the California State Firefighters Association maybe lobbying to have local jurisdictions assess an income tax.

12. Adjournment

Meeting adjourned at 2:25 p.m.

Karlena Rannals
Secretary

James H Ashcraft
President